unfolding both inside and outside the academy in this moment, scholarship is attending
more purposefully than ever to marginalized voices in history—here, an "unlettered" nun.
McNamer's volume, the result of massive labor and will, is a crucial participant in that move-
ment. We are unlikely ever to get the "ideal forms of proof" (xcv) that would tell us for
certain who wrote the *testo breve*, and whether it indeed predated the Latin MVC. What
McNamer has presented in pointing this out is an implicit challenge. In the face of per-
suasive historical research, incredulity belies a distinct lack of imagination; it becomes less
about scholarship, and more a political choice. McNamer's work is an exciting contribution,
not only to medieval scholarship but to the academy many of us would like to build.

SHANNON MCHUGH, University of Massachusetts Boston

HANS-RUDOLF MEIER, DOROTHEA SCHWINN SCHÜRMANN, MARCO BERNASCONI, STEFAN
    HESS, CAROLA JÄGGI, ANNE NAGEL, and FERDINAND PAJOR, *Das Basler Münster*.
    (Die Kunstdenkmäler des Kantons Basel-Stadt 10; Die Kunstdenkmäler der Schweiz
    138.) Bern: Gesellschaft für Schweizerische Kunstgeschichte GSK, 2019. Pp. 514;
    many color and black-and-white figures, maps, and diagrams. 120 CHF. ISBN: 978-3-0379
    -7573-2.
    doi:10.1086/714941

HANS RUDOLF SENNHAUSER and HANS RUDOLF COURVOISIER, *Das Basler Münster: Die
    frühen Kathedralen und der Heinrichsdom; Ausgrabungen 1966, 1973/74*, in collaboration
    with ALFRED HIDBER, ECKART KÜHNE, and WERNER PETER. Ostfildern: Jan Thorbecke
    Verlag, 2018. Pp. 456; many color and black-and-white figures, maps, tables, and dia-
    grams, and many maps in separate sheets. €80. ISBN: 978-3-7995-1265-7.
    doi:10.1086/714941

Basel Cathedral is one of the core medieval monuments in Switzerland, from the extant late
Romanesque cathedral dating to 1170 onward and the late Gothic alterations that occurred
after the serious earthquake of 1356, when the vaults and the chancel collapsed. Through-
out the medieval period, Basel Cathedral connected architectonically with Alsace, Swabia,
and the Old Swiss Confederation, and also competed with cathedrals and churches such as
Freiburg, Strasbourg, Konstanz, Lausanne, and further afield.

The impressive volume by Hans Rudolf Sennhauser with contributions by Hans Rudolf
Courvoisier and other colleagues provides us with detailed insights into the archaeological
evidence of the earliest cathedral buildings, particularly the so-called "Henry Minster" in Basel.
It fills a long-lasting gap that has existed between the first excavations carried out at the site
in 1966 and the main campaigns in 1973/74. During this time, Sennhauser published sev-
eral articles about the excavations that included preliminary proposals for reconstruction of
the cathedral, but did not give a detailed analytical overview of the architectural history.
Publication of Sennhauser's final report was delayed, and as a result is in competition with
the recently published architectural inventory of the Basel Minster by Hans-Rudolf Meier
and colleagues. This inventory was scheduled for publication in the 1980s under the author-
ship of the late François Maurer, but it was only published recently by an entirely new research
team under the direction of Meier and Dorothea Schwinn Schürmann. Just before this volume
appeared in print in 2019, Sennhauser published his work, which contains documentation of all
the excavations, after a series of court proceedings about the copyright of the material. Marco
Bernasconi, head of the Basel archaeology division, gives an alternative interpretation of the
archaeological findings in the inventory volume.

Seen in this light we are in the remarkable situation of having two versions of church
reconstructions for review. In this case we have to evaluate two contradictory versions of

pre-Romanesque buildings, published with strikingly different conclusions, which poses the principal problem of how to translate excavated structures into a comprehensive reconstruction.

Basel Minster's Carolingian structure, named after Bishop Haito, abbot of Reichenau from 805 to 823, is not easy to recreate. Sennhauser's reconstruction includes a western front with two flanking round towers (Sennhauser, 76, nos. 158 and 159), a three-aisled nave (nos. 126, 73, 511, and 512), characterized as "a single-nave church with two annexes" (73). The particular findings indicate an original single-nave church (nos. 113 and 155) of 60m in length, with no arcades in the north wall (no. 155), flanked only by a southern aisle/annex (nos. 126 and 502). Its south wall was extended eastward as a passage to the alleged bishop's palace at the eastern edge of the site, up to the level of the outside crypt (94 no. 558). Although Sennhauser argued for the existence of an eastern apse in 1975, he has subsequently denied its existence with a poor defense (73). It simply remains unclear where the east end of the building with its proposed crypt was located, and whether it was shaped as an apsidal or rectangular scheme. In combination with the outside crypt, an extended east structure is more likely. Sennhauser defends his reconstruction by comparing it to similar structures, such as those at Konstanz and St. Gall (75). The remains of the western round towers in the Basel Minster (nos. 158 and 159) indicate that aisles or annexes were part of the original concept, executed in different phases (49). In this respect we cannot argue with the tradition of single-nave cathedrals. Haito's cathedral should be regarded as a smaller version of Konstanz Cathedral or the abbey church of Fulda, if one prefers an apsidal scheme. Sennhauser viewed the westwork structure as an early rendition of a twin tower façade (63). There are no parallels for such a scheme in Carolingian times. In the St. Gall plan the two towers are solitary structures. All other comparisons, among others Neuwiller-lès-Saverne, date from the eleventh century. It is more likely, as the huge foundation walls indicate (nos. 158 and 159), that there was a massive west structure with separated east and west walls (no. 294). One could claim a smaller version of the Centula "Westwerk" akin to the west structure of Gernrode (which dates to 970), but not as part of the western nave with flanking towers.

Another important issue is the existence and reconstruction of Basel Minster's outside crypt, which is not axially aligned to the main church building. Its eastern center constitutes a tri-apsidal structure (82 nos. 563–566). Whether the structure was vaulted or covered with a flat ceiling remains an open question. Because of its tripartite structure with massive walls in the lateral spaces, Sennhauser dates it to the second quarter of the tenth century, with reference to the outside crypt of St. Maximin in Trier (dated to 942). In Meier et al., Bernasconi's survey of Basel Minster reconstructed an isolated tripartite apsidal annex. He also doubts the existence of the remains of the diagonal east wall (Sennhauser, no. 543) which Sennhauser took as a marker, resulting in a conjectural reconstruction as an extension of the east chancel (Meier et al., 80–81). What is difficult to conceive in Bernasconi's reconstruction (Meier et al., 78–83) is the lack of a connection between the apsidal annex and the church. There are no crypt structures apart from those found in the main building, and so the apsidal annex should be thought of more as a "secondary chapel." Consequentially, all of Bernasconi's reconstructions are visualized as three-dimensional models, presenting conjectural structures. A look at the Carolingian east structure of Saint-Denis, including the Hilduin Chapel (839), might help to understand Basel's annexed chapel. Hans Reinhardt has already pointed out the close relations of Saint-Denis and Basel, where Bishop Waldo was appointed abbot in 802.

The reconstructions of the second church, built under Adalbero II (999–1025), reveal similar problems. Consecrated in 1019 in the presence of the last Ottonian emperor Henry II and his spouse Cunigunde, it demonstrates the close connection of Basel with the Holy Roman Empire, when the emperor became the designated heir of Basel and the kingdom of Burgundy in 1006/1016. Bernasconi reconstructs a vast structure encompassing the Carolingian buildings (Meier et al., 85–89), with a three-aisled nave containing the dimensions

of its predecessor, lacking west towers, with a rectangular chancel with crypt in the first stage (limited with wall 39/Sennhauser no. 517/18), and an ambulatory as an eastern extension that makes Basel a model for ambulatory churches of the eleventh century (Meier et al., 89–90).

Sennhauser also takes two phases for granted, but in the reverse order (132–33): first, a new ambulatory scheme with flanking east towers, and second, the new nave with an additional inner crypt. In detail, he adds an art historical perspective to reinforce his thesis concerning the alteration of the nave by introducing pillars and a gallery scheme, as well as the west façade (132–36). He also raises the question of the presence of an existing transept. Here definitive conclusions remain speculative. While Bernasconi denies a twin tower façade (Meier et al., 86), Sennhauser takes the examples of Strasbourg and Einsiedeln as models (134–136). But around 1030–50, the only complex westwork structures with two west towers combined with paradise chapels are documented at Hildesheim Cathedral and in abbeys such as Limburg an der Hardt. Perhaps Einsiedeln had the first real twin tower façade (c. 1040), also present at Basel, where the St. George tower (c. 1100) remained as part of the actual façade.

The assumed protruding transept lacks any evidence, as Sennhauser concedes that there is "no Ottonian fundament as such" (161). It is likely that there was an extended space aloft separated by monumental arcades like Nevers. The same open question remains with the proposed crossing tower. All these elements, Sennhauser argued, should prove the parallel tracks with the "Werner" cathedral of Strasbourg (1015–c. 1040). Bernasconi and Meier are right in depicting the problem of the timescale: the changed shape of Basel Cathedral at the time of its consecration in 1019 was more than one-and-a-half centuries before the new structure was begun prior to the fire of 1185 (see Marco Bernasconi and Hans-Rudolf Meier, "Das Heinrichs-Münster: Baugeschichte, Bestand, Rekonstruktion," in *Gold & Ruhm: Kunst und Macht unter Kaiser Heinrich II*, ed. Marc Fehlmann, Michael Matzke, and Sabine Söll-Tauchert [2019], 231–33). While both authors derive the special ambulatory scheme of the Basel Minster from Burgundian neighboring cathedrals such as Lausanne or certain Italian examples like Ivrea or San Vito in Verona, Sennhauser emphasizes the northern connection (Sennhauser, 219–20). Because the ambulatory was in all likelihood a crypt ambulatory, extended to the chancel level, it appeared from outside as an ambulatory scheme. This rare scheme has only one parallel in the west choir of St. Michael in Hildesheim (c. 1020), where it was used like Basel as burial place for the founding bishop. Regardless of how to explain this connection, Sennhauser's more relevant conclusion proposes that the Ottonian shape was decisive and even partially included into the late-Romanesque structure (186–89). This practice generally is considered relevant at that time for other cathedrals such as Bamberg, Magdeburg, or Trier.

In Meier et al., Bernasconi has an opportunity to take a fresh look at the archaeological record and to make relevant suggestions, in particular for the Ottonian phase. He points to several inconsistencies in Sennhauser's reconstructions. It is notable that Sennhauser was always firm in his convictions and rarely used the conditional tense. Nevertheless, Sennhauser's comprehensive study supports the archaeological findings, with complete plans and a wide-ranging spread of comparative samples. Even if some of his conclusions are questionable, it remains the enduring compendium of the early medieval structures of Basel Cathedral.

In the paragraphs above, we focused on Bernasconi's essay to work out the differences from Sennhauser's reconstructions. However, Meier et al.'s inventory volume spans more than five hundred pages, including a discussion of the general historical setting (Stefan Hess), a comprehensive essay on the building history (98–148), and a detailed analysis of the fabric of the cathedral itself, including sculpture (Schwinn Schürmann in Meier et al., 152–234), followed by a catalogue of liturgical furniture, murals, and tombs (Schwinn Schürmann and Carola Jäggi).

Meier's diligent investigation with extraordinary plans of the existing building provides a clear framework for dating and comparative settings. The new structure started as early as 1170 in two phases until 1220, first with the nave and west façade, including the old St. George tower, with dimensions almost similar to the preceding building. The transept and ambulatory choir were erected in a second phase, referencing the Ottonian structure. In stylistic terms, the structures of Worms-West and the Alsatian architecture with Strasbourg east (1171–86) served as focal points, and further, the Freiburg Minster of c. 1190/1200 was relevant. The ambulatory structure followed the cathedral of Lausanne (108–09). Northern Italian structures such as Modena gave the model for the gallery scheme, which hardly existed in this region, probably transmitted via the almost overlooked Grossmünster in Zürich (1160s). Meier further reinterprets the Gallus Porch, one of the first portals with full jamb sculptures outside France (1170s). With its triumphal arch scheme it referenced the Porte Noir of the see of Besançon and, in stylistic terms, Petershausen (178–85). Basel Cathedral should therefore be assumed to be at the vanguard of a merging tradition situated between north and south while also bringing together the old and the new. John of Gmünd, one of the most prestigious architects of the Parler family, was hired for the reconstruction after the disastrous earthquake in 1359. He preserved the existing structure by separating the ambulatory from the crypt and also modernized the galleries and clerestory. According to Meier, Bohemian buildings such as Kolin were most relevant (125). Nevertheless, as a model of the fashionable harp-like tracery, derived from Strasbourg, the very sophisticatedly-decorated Cistercian church of Salem (1320) should be taken into consideration.

While Sennhauser provided his version of the preceding structures in the context of other early medieval buildings, Meier et. al. provides a rich, encompassing compendium of the entire history of Basel Cathedral's architecture. Many open questions are answered as the dry matter of an inventory is enriched by eye-opening historical and visual coverage. It will remain an indispensable "bible" for further research for decades to come.

Bernd Nicolai, University of Bern

Influential full-length studies focusing on medieval representations of the Virgin Mary and the cultic status she enjoyed from the eleventh century onward have proliferated during the last forty or so years. Beginning, perhaps, with Marina Warner's exhaustive *Alone of All Her Sex: The Myth and Cult of the Virgin Mary* (1976), feminist approaches in particular have gained increasing traction alongside more theoretical analyses of the place of the Virgin within the Christian cultural imaginary—Julia Kristeva's pivotal essay "Stabat Mater" (trans. 1985) constitutes a prime example. Since then we have been gifted a steady flow of such works. For example: Mary Clayton, *The Cult of the Virgin Mary in Anglo-Saxon England* (1990); Sarah Jane Boss, *Empress and Handmaid: On Nature and Gender in the Cult of the Virgin Mary* (2000); Teresa P. Reed, *Shadows of Mary: Reading the Virgin Mary in Medieval Texts* (2003); Miri Rubin, *Mother of God: A History of the Virgin Mary* (2009); and, more recently, Georgiana Donavin, *Scribit Mater: Mary and the Language of the Arts in the Literature of Medieval England* (2012). The question, therefore, is whether there has remained a need for yet another book centering on the medieval theological, iconographic and literary obsession with the figure of the Virgin Mary. A close reading of Laura Saetveit Miles's new study will serve to answer this question resoundingly in the affirmative.